

**CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
BOARD OF PENSIONS AND RETIREMENT
Meeting of May 24, 2018**

MINUTES

On May 24, 2018, Jacqueline Dunn called the Regular Meeting of the Board of Pensions and Retirement to order at 9:32 AM in the Board's Conference Room.

Present: Jacqueline Dunn
Rebecca Rhynhart
Pedro Rodriguez
Christopher Rupe
Carol Stukes-Baylor
Ronald Stagliano
Brian Coughlin
Veronica Pankey
Sharolyn Murphy

Also Attending: Francis Bielli - Board of Pensions
Shamika Taliaferro – Board of Pensions
Bill Rubin – Board of Pensions
Kellan White – Controller's Office
Ellen Berkowitz, Adam Coleman – Law Dept.
Christopher DiFusco, Bernard Buckley – Investment Unit
Tyrone Jordon, Jim Cousounis – Investment Unit
Dominique Cherry, Eryn-Ashlei Bailey
Kristyn Bair – Investment Unit
Jeff Francis, Eric Stevenson, Marc Metzger- Nationwide
Bina Kumar, Emanuel Mahand – Nationwide
Will Greene – Loop Capital
Kevin Curran – CIM, LLC
Dave Smith, Queto Obded - Marquette
Wenting Lao – Office of Human Resources

Jacqueline Dunn called the meeting to order and stated that the first order of business was the Consideration of the Minutes of April 19, 2018.

Veronica Pankey made a motion to approve the Minutes of April 19, 2018. Pedro Rodriguez seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried 7-0-1.

CONSIDERATION OF (130) PENSION APPLICATIONS AND (85) WITHDRAWAL APPLICATIONS

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve. Veronica Pankey seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried 8-0.

APPLICATION FOR SERVICE-CONNECTED DISABILITY BENEFITS

Case of Tracy Savage, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits –Plan A

This is an application submitted by Tracy Savage, former Firefighter for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan A.

According to Ms. Savage, on December 15, 2013 she was exiting the fire engine when her foot slipped from the stair and she fell onto the floor causing injuries to her leg and knee.

Brian Coughlin made a motion to approve. Ronald Stagliano seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried unanimously 8-0.

Case of William Campbell, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits –Plan B

This is an application submitted by William Campbell, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan B.

According to Mr. Campbell, on August 31, 2013 while responding to a male who was attempting to enter a house he did not reside in, the male began causing a disturbance. Mr. Campbell states that while arresting the male for public drunkenness and disorderly conduct the male suspect resisted, he turned and shoved him into a vehicle, grabbed for his extended “Taser” and caught his wrist twisting it back and forth during the struggle.

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve. Brian Coughlin seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried unanimously 8-0.

Case of Michele D. Epps, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan B

This is an application submitted by Michele Epps, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan B.

According to Ms. Epps, on January 26, 2010 while in foot pursuit of a male suspect across a gravel covered lot she felt pain in her knee. Ms. Epps further states that following surgery and therapy she continued to experience pain.

Pedro Rodriguez made a motion to deny. Sharolyn Murphy seconded the motion.

The motion to deny carried 4-0-4.

Case of Vivian Harris, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits -Plan B

This is an application submitted by Vivian Harris, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan B.

According to Ms. Harris, on November 13, 2013 while transporting a body from the third floor of a building she noticed swelling in her ring finger. Ms. Harris further states that the ring finger does not completely bend and she has difficulty grasping and holding objects.

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve. Carol Stukes-Baylor seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried unanimously 8-0.

Case of Daniel Kelly, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan B

This is an application submitted by Daniel Kelly, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan B.

According to Mr. Kelly, on November 4, 2013 while making a narcotics arrest the suspect became combative. Mr. Kelly states that the suspect kicked him in his knee causing his injury.

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve. Carol Stukes-Baylor seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried unanimously 8-0.

Case of Robert Thurman, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan B

This is an **administrative** application submitted on behalf of Robert Thurman, former Police Sergeant for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan B.

Mr. Thurman applied for Optional Early pension benefits on January 30, 2017. He did not wish to apply for Service-Connected Disability benefits and did not provide a narrative of his injury of July 21, 2016.

When it was disclosed that Mr. Thurman was receiving a monthly benefit from Workers' Compensation effective January 12, 2017 his Optional Early application was converted to an application for Service-Connected Disability.

Sharolyn Murphy made a motion to deny. Ronald Stagliano seconded the motion.

The motion to deny carried unanimously 8-0.

Case of Gloriadean Mitchell, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan D

This is an application submitted by Gloriadean Mitchell, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan D.

According to Ms. Mitchell, on April 7, 2016 while posting temporary no parking signs at or near 33rd and Dauphin Streets she fell into an uncovered hole striking her right temple, right eye, and left knee.

Sharolyn Murphy made a motion to deny. Pedro Rodriguez seconded the motion. The motion failed 3-5.

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve. Brian Coughlin seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried 5-3.

Case of Theodore Williams, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan J

This is an application submitted by Theodore Williams, former Water Distribution Repair Worker with the Water Department for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan J.

According to Mr. Williams, on March 13, 2008 while pulling on a thirty-six (36) inch lid in the street he felt a pop in his right shoulder and could not move.

Carol Stukes-Baylor made a motion to approve. Veronica Pankey seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried 5-3.

Case of Georgia Kolbas, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits –Plan Y

This is an application submitted by Georgia Kolbas, former Urban Park Ranger with the Department of Parks & Recreation for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan Y.

According to Ms. Kolbas, on May 27, 2014 she was bitten by a tick while working in Wissahickon Park. Ms. Kolbas states that she was infected with Lyme disease from that tick.

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve. Veronica Pankey seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried 5-3.

Case of Joseph Meredith, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan Y

This is an application submitted by Joseph Meredith, former Semi-Skilled Laborer with the Water Department for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan Y.

According to Mr. Meredith, on September 19, 2016 he fell while trying to replace a manhole cover; he stretched out his arms to break the fall and injured both wrists. Mr. Meredith states that when he returned to work on or about December 20, 2016 he injured his neck and shoulder while shredding boxes of paper.

Sharolyn Murphy made a motion to deny. Pedro Rodriguez seconded the motion.

The motion to deny carried 4-0-4.

Case of Hagar Redmond, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan Y

This is an application submitted by Hagar Redmond, former Police Communications Dispatcher for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan Y.

According to Ms. Redmond, on January 8, 2014 while walking to the restroom she rolled her ankle outward and sustained a fracture.

Sharolyn Murphy made a motion to deny. Pedro Rodriguez seconded the motion.

The motion to deny carried 4-0-4.

OLD BUSINESS

Case of Glenn T. Burns, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan A

This case was tabled at the March 28, 2018 Board meeting at the request of trustee Brian Coughlin.

This is an application submitted by Glenn Burns, former Firefighter for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "A".

According to Mr. Burns, on May 8, 2006 while exiting Ladder 20 his foot became entangled on the strap of a searchlight and he fell backwards to the ground landing on his tailbone and slamming his head. Mr. Burns states that on December 8, 2012 while participating in harness bailout training he began to feel a lot of pain in his neck and lower back and had to stop. Finally, according to Mr. Burns, on March 29, 2015 while fighting a dwelling fire he stepped on a plastic gate and fell down a flight of stairs.

Brian Coughlin made a motion to approve. Ronald Stagliano seconded the motion. The motion tied 4-4. The chair voted to break the tie. The motion failed 4-5.

Pedro Rodriguez made a motion to deny. Sharolyn Murphy seconded the motion.

The motion to deny carried 5-4.

Case of Catherine Young, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan Y

This case was **denied** at the Board meeting held on January 28, 2016. A hearing panel was held on Wednesday, March 28, 2018. Ms. Young will be pursuing her case as a **SAMMONS** issue.

The hearing panel recommendations are as follows:

Marsha Greene-Jones:	Denial
Sharolyn L. Murphy, Esq.:	Deny
Carol Stukes-Baylor:	Approved

Case Summary:

This is an application submitted by Catherine Young, former Youth Detention Counselor with the Department of Human Services, for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Plan Y.

According to Ms. Young on December 5, 2012 while breaking up a fight between residents she fell into a chair hitting her hip and arm against the metal arm. She reports that during the physical altercation her partner and the two combatants fell on her pinning her to the chair. Ms. Young states that over the course of her career she sustained other injuries while breaking up fights, restraining residents, preventing escapes, physically (forcefully) placing residents into their rooms, and suicide attempts.

Sharolyn Murphy made a motion to deny. Pedro Rodriguez seconded the motion.

The motion tied 4-4. The Chair voted to deny. The motion to deny carried 5-4.

Case of Robert Lutz, Jr., Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits – Plan B

This case was **denied** at the Board meeting held on September 26, 2016. A hearing panel was held on Wednesday, April 11, 2018. Mr. Lutz will be pursuing his case as a **SAMMONS** issue.

The hearing panel recommendations are as follows:

Jacqueline Dunn:	Approved
Sharolyn L. Murphy, Esq.:	Approve
Veronica M. Pankey:	Approved for SCD

Case Summary:

This is an application submitted by Robert W. Lutz, Jr., former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan B.

According to Mr. Lutz, on September 14, 2013, while responding to a shooting his police vehicle struck a car head on and he suffered multiple injuries.

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve. Veronica Pankey seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried unanimously 8-0.

APPEAL OF ADMINSTRATIVE DENIAL FOR MINIMUM WIDOW'S BENEFIT

Case of Richard L. Dabney, Deceased, Appeal of Administrative Denial for Minimum Widow's Benefit as Common Law/Legal Spouse - Plan "D"

This case was **denied** at the Board meeting held on October 26, 2017. A hearing panel was held on Wednesday, March 28, 2018.

The hearing panel recommendations are as follows:

Marsha Greene-Jones:	Denial
Sharolyn L. Murphy, Esq.:	Deny
Carol Stukes-Baylor:	No. Deny

Case Summary:

This is an application by Alvinia L. Dabney as the common law/legal spouse of Richard L. Dabney, deceased, for a Minimum Widow's survivorship benefit in Plan D.

Richard L. Dabney, a Policeman, retired with a Service Connected Disability benefit on August 7, 1971. He withdrew his contributions instead of choosing a survivorship option. He died on March 14, 2016.

On April 4, 2016, the Board received an application for a minimum widow's survivorship benefit from his widow, Alvinia L. Dabney. Mrs. Dabney submitted a divorce decree showing that Mr. Dabney and his prior spouse, Vivian, divorced on January 23, 1975. Mrs. Dabney also submitted a marriage certificate for Mr. Dabney and herself dated June 28, 1975.

Mrs. Dabney was informed that she was not eligible for the survivorship since Mr. Dabney and she were not married two years prior to his retirement. Mrs. Dabney wrote a letter stating she felt she had been wrongfully denied. She was subsequently administratively denied and has appealed.

Alvinia L. Dabney is applying for approval of common law status of her marriage to meet the two year prior to retirement requirement per section 22-304 *Minimum Benefit of the Public Employees Retirement Code*. If approved, Mrs. Dabney would receive a \$250.00 monthly survivorship benefit.

The Board reviewed the pertinent case information and documents submitted from Mrs. Dabney.

Sharolyn Murphy made a motion to deny. Pedro Rodriguez seconded the motion.

The motion to deny carried unanimously 8-0.

NEW BUSINESS

- **Executive Director's Report** – Mr. Bielli stated that Ms. Stukes-Baylor was re-elected to the NCPERS Board. The Board congratulated her. Several Board members attended the PAPERS conference held in Harrisburg, PA on May 22nd and 23, 2018.

Rick Stewart, head of the One Philly Project will come in August to give the Board an update on the project.

Business and Education Travel Request

- 1) Workers' Compensation Conference June 7-8, 2018 in Hershey, PA

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve Sharon Fulton to attend the Workers' Compensation conference in Hershey, PA. Veronica Pankey seconded the motion.

The motion to approve Sharon Thorpe to attend the Workers' Compensation conference June 7-8, 2018 in Hershey, PA carried unanimously 8-0.

- 2) Koried Global Summit Annual Trustees Conference July 11-13, 2018 in Coral Gables, Florida

Veronica Pankey made a motion to approve. Ronald Stagliano seconded the motion.

The motion to approve trustees to attend the Koried Global Summit in Coral Gables, Florida July 11-13, 2018 carried unanimously 8-0.

- **Litigation Summary** - Ms. Berkowitz stated that the Dailey (disqualification) case is stayed pending state court proceedings and a list of Common Pleas cases was distributed to the Board.

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to adjourn. Veronica Pankey seconded the motion.

The meeting adjourned at 9:42 AM.